

# **Unsettled Issues on the Viability and Cost-Effectiveness of Automation in Aerospace Manufacturing**

**Professor Philip Webb, PhD**

# Unsettled Issues on the Viability and Cost-Effectiveness of Automation in Aerospace Manufacturing

**Professor Philip Webb, PhD**  
*Cranfield University*

---

**EDGE DEVELOPMENT TEAM**

---

AbdulRahman El-Nounu, PhD, Spirit  
AeroSystems

Graeme Ralph, Spirit AeroSystems

Marco Chacin, PhD, Airbus

Jon Carberry, EngD, BAE Systems

Craig Turnbull, Electroimpact

Andrew Porstmore, PhD, GKN Aerospace

Oliver Selby, FANUC





## About the Publisher

SAE International® is a global association of more than 128,000 engineers and related technical experts in the aerospace, automotive and commercial-vehicle industries. Our core competencies are life-long learning and voluntary consensus standards development. Visit [sae.org](http://sae.org)

## SAE EDGE™ Research Report Disclaimer

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports focus on topics that are dynamic, in which knowledge is incomplete, and which have yet to be standardized. They represent the collective wisdom of a group of experts and serve as a practical guide to the reader in understanding unsettled subject matter. They are not meant to provide a recommended practice or protocol. The experts have assembled as a community of practitioners to contribute and collectivize their thoughts and points of view. These are not the positions of the institutions or businesses with which they are affiliated, nor is one contributor's perspective advanced over others. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are the property of SAE International and SAE alone is responsible for their content.

## About This Publication

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports provide state-of-the-art and state-of-industry examinations of the most significant

topics in mobility engineering. Contributors to SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are experts from academia, government, industry, and research who have come together to explore and define the most critical advancements, challenges, and future direction in areas such as vehicle automation, unmanned aircraft, cybersecurity, advanced propulsion, advanced manufacturing, Internet of Things, and connectivity.

## Related Resources

**SAE MOBILUS® Advance Manufacturing Knowledge Hub**  
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/advanced-manufacturing/>

**SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Issues on Human-Robot Collaboration and Automation in Aerospace Manufacturing by Professor Phil Webb, PhD and Sarah Fletcher, PhD**  
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2020024/>

## SAE Team

Frank Menchaca, Chief Growth Officer  
Michael Thompson, Director of Standards, Information and Research Publications  
Monica Nogueira, Director of Content Acquisition and Development  
Beth Ellen Dibeler, Product Manager  
William Kucinski, Managing Technical Editor

Copyright © 2021 SAE International. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, distributed, or transmitted, in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of SAE International. For permission and licensing requests, contact SAE Permissions, 400 Commonwealth Drive, Warrendale, PA 15096-0001 USA; e-mail: [copyright@sae.org](mailto:copyright@sae.org); phone: +1-724-772-4028; fax: +1-724-772-9765.

Printed in USA

Information contained in this work has been obtained by SAE International from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither SAE International nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither SAE International nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that SAE International and its authors are supplying information but are not attempting to render engineering or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

**EPR2021005**

**ISSN 2640-3536**

**e-ISSN 2640-3544**

**ISBN 978-1-4686-0291-3**

**To purchase bulk quantities, please contact:** SAE Customer Service

E-mail: [CustomerService@sae.org](mailto:CustomerService@sae.org)

Phone: 877-606-7323 (inside USA and Canada)  
+1-724-776-4970 (outside USA)

Fax: +1-724-776-0790

<https://www.sae.org/publications/edge-research-reports>

## About the Editor



Credit Cranfield University

**Professor Phil Webb** is the head of the Centre for Structures, Assembly and Intelligent Automation at Cranfield University, where he holds the Royal Academy of Engineering and Airbus Chair.

He has over 25 years of experience in research into advanced manufacturing automation and robotics, and has published widely on the subject. He specializes in the application of automation in the aerospace industry and works with most of the major aerospace companies including Airbus, BAE Systems, Bombardier, and Rolls-Royce. A core element of this work is the development of human-robot collaborative systems, particularly using large high-payload robots. Professor Webb has published in this area and has developed numerous production demonstrators as well. His role as an Airbus Professor sits between academia and industry giving him the opportunity to bring emerging engineering research across into the manufacturing domain.

He is a Fellow of the Institution of Engineering and Technology, a member of the SAE International Automated Assembly and Fastening Committee, and a member the Council of the British Automation and Robotics Association. He has also served as the UK representative to the International Federation for Robotics. He sits on the ATI Future Structures Specialist Advisory Group and is the editor in chief of the *Aircraft Engineering and Aerospace Technology Journal*. He has served as an organizer and contributor to SAE's AeroFast and AeroTech conferences for many years.

# contents

## About the Editor

<b>Unsettled Issues on the Viability and Cost-Effectiveness of Automation in Aerospace Manufacturing</b> . . . . .	<b>3</b>
<b>Introduction</b> . . . . .	<b>4</b>
<i>State of the Industry</i> . . . . .	<b>4</b>
<i>Types of Automation</i> . . . . .	<b>5</b>
Bespoke Fixed Automation . . . . .	<b>5</b>
Robot-Based Automation . . . . .	<b>5</b>
Flexible Automation . . . . .	<b>5</b>
<i>Applications of Automation</i> . . . . .	<b>6</b>
Drilling Joining and Fastening . . . . .	<b>6</b>
Welding . . . . .	<b>6</b>
Sealing . . . . .	<b>7</b>
Assembly . . . . .	<b>7</b>
Composite Manufacturing . . . . .	<b>7</b>
<i>Unsettled Issues on the Viability and Cost-Effectiveness of Automation in Aerospace Manufacturing</i> . . . . .	<b>8</b>
<b>Understanding Why Automation Fails or Succeeds</b> . . . . .	<b>9</b>
<i>Supplier/Customer Expectations</i> . . . . .	<b>9</b>
<i>Cost</i> . . . . .	<b>9</b>
<i>Technical Failures</i> . . . . .	<b>9</b>
<i>Resistance to Change</i> . . . . .	<b>10</b>
<i>Failing to Integrate Automation into the Production System</i> . . . . .	<b>10</b>
Company Knowledge . . . . .	<b>10</b>
<i>Recommendations</i> . . . . .	<b>10</b>
<b>Determining Design Standards and Approaches for the Management of Large Parts and Interfaces</b> . . . . .	<b>10</b>

<i>Recommendations</i> . . . . .	<b>11</b>
----------------------------------	-----------

<b>Determining Best Practice and Crossover Technologies from Other Industries</b> . . . . .	<b>11</b>
<i>Organizational Elements</i> . . . . .	<b>12</b>
<i>Flexibility</i> . . . . .	<b>12</b>
<i>Process Differences</i> . . . . .	<b>12</b>
<i>Safety</i> . . . . .	<b>12</b>
<i>Supplier Engagement</i> . . . . .	<b>12</b>
<i>Business Case</i> . . . . .	<b>12</b>
<i>Recommendations</i> . . . . .	<b>13</b>
<b>Optimizing the Application of Industry 4.0 and Other Emerging Technologies</b> . . . . .	<b>13</b>
<i>Data Management and Understanding</i> . . . . .	<b>13</b>
<i>Low-Cost Metrology</i> . . . . .	<b>14</b>
<i>5G Technology</i> . . . . .	<b>14</b>
<i>One-Way and Determinate Assembly</i> . . . . .	<b>14</b>
<i>Recommendations</i> . . . . .	<b>14</b>
<b>Understanding the Impact of Economics and Demographics on the Uptake of Automation</b> . . . . .	<b>15</b>
<i>Recommendations</i> . . . . .	<b>15</b>
<b>Summary</b> . . . . .	<b>16</b>
<i>SAE EDGE™ Research Reports</i> . . . . .	<b>16</b>
<i>Next Steps for Unsettled Issues on the Viability and Cost-Effectiveness of Automation in Aerospace Manufacturing</i> . . . . .	<b>16</b>
<i>Recommendations</i> . . . . .	<b>17</b>
<i>Definitions</i> . . . . .	<b>17</b>
<i>Acknowledgments</i> . . . . .	<b>17</b>
<i>References</i> . . . . .	<b>17</b>
<i>Contact Information</i> . . . . .	<b>18</b>



# Unsettled Issues on the Viability and Cost-Effectiveness of Automation in Aerospace Manufacturing

## Abstract

The aerospace manufacturing industry is, in many ways, one of the most sophisticated commercial manufacturing systems in existence. It uses cutting-edge materials to build highly sophisticated and safety-critical structures and parts. These components must withstand thermal and physical stresses at the limit of their structural and material properties. However, in many ways, it is also quite unsophisticated, with multiple processes relying largely upon human skill and dexterity. Unlike other manufacturing industries, such as automotive or consumer goods, there has been very little uptake of automation apart from its use in the supply chain for relatively simple applications (e.g., machine loading and welding) or through the use of large special-purpose machines.

There are increasing efforts to introduce automation, but uptake is still relatively low. Why is this and what needs to be done? Some may point to part size or the need for accuracy. However, as with any complex issue, the problems are multifactorial. While many articles and papers have already been written on this subject, this report seeks to build a more comprehensive picture of the views and attitudes backed by technical analysis to answer some of the questions (or at least have a better understanding of them). This report will also broaden the discussion from “Unsettled Issues on Human-Robot Collaboration and Automation in Aerospace Manufacturing” with a focus on conventional approaches to automation, as many of the business drivers, shortcomings, and barriers identified in this report overlap with human-robot collaborative approaches. To reflect on these differences while maintaining a degree of synergy, we have approached some of the same expert contributors but also sought alternative views. There are no right or wrong answers to the automation conundrum and indeed there are many contradictions. However, we hope this report will at least serve to stimulate the conversation around the effective deployment of automation and help to advance the cause.

NOTE: SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are intended to identify and illuminate key issues in emerging, but still unsettled, technologies of interest to the mobility industry. The goal of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports is to stimulate discussion and work in the hope of promoting and speeding resolution of identified issues. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are not intended to resolve the challenges they identify or close any topic to further scrutiny.

**PROFESSOR PHILIP WEBB, PhD**  
*Cranfield University*

### EDGE Development Team

AbdulRahman El-Nounu, PhD, *Spirit AeroSystems*  
Graeme Ralph, *Spirit AeroSystems*  
Marco Chacin, PhD, *Airbus*  
Jon Carberry, EngD, *BAE Systems*  
Craig Turnbull, *Electroimpact*  
Andrew Porstmore, PhD, *GKN Aerospace*  
Oliver Selby, *FANUC*

ISSN 2640-3536