

# **Unsettled Domains Concerning Autonomous System Validation and Verification Processes**

**Fabio Alonso da Silva**

# Unsettled Domains Concerning Autonomous System Validation and Verification Processes

**Fabio Alonso da Silva**  
*ElletoCrafts Aerospace Ind.*

---

**EDGE DEVELOPMENT TEAM**

Alexandre Gesualdi, *ACG Consulting BR*  
Paulo Allemand Donato, *retired from Embraer*

Robert Voros, *Textron Aviation*





## About the Publisher

SAE International® is a global association of more than 128,000 engineers and related technical experts in the aerospace, automotive, and commercial-vehicle industries. Our core competencies are lifelong learning and voluntary consensus standards development. Visit [sae.org](http://sae.org)

## SAE EDGE™ Research Report Disclaimer

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports focus on topics that are dynamic, in which knowledge is incomplete, and have yet to be standardized. They represent the collective wisdom of a group of experts and serve as a practical guide to the reader in understanding unsettled subject matter. They are not meant to provide a recommended practice or protocol. The experts engaged have contributed their own thoughts and points of view, and these are not the positions of the institutions or businesses with which they are affiliated. A professional writer has collectivized their input; there is no one contributor's perspective being advanced, but rather that of a community of practitioners. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are the property of SAE International and SAE alone is responsible for their content.

## About This Publication

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports provide state-of-the-art and state-of-the -industry examinations of the most significant topics in mobility engineering. SAE EDGE™ contributors are experts from research, academia, and industry who have come together to explore and define the most critical advancements, challenges, and future direction in areas such as vehicle automation, unmanned aircraft, Internet of Things and connectivity, cybersecurity, advanced propulsion, and advanced manufacturing.

## Related Resources

SAE MOBILUS® Automated & Connected Knowledge Hub  
<http://sae.org/Mobilus/Automated>

## SAE Team

Frank Menchaca, Chief Product Officer  
Michael Thompson, Director, Standards, Information and Research Publications  
Monica Nogueira, Acquisitions Director  
Jill Leonard, Product Manager  
William Kucinski, Managing Technical Editor

---

Copyright © 2020 SAE International. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, distributed, or transmitted, in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of SAE International. For permission and licensing requests, contact SAE Permissions, 400 Commonwealth Drive, Warrendale, PA 15096-0001 USA; e-mail: [copyright@sae.org](mailto:copyright@sae.org); phone: 724-772-4028; fax: 724-772-9765.

Printed in USA

Information contained in this work has been obtained by SAE International from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither SAE International nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither SAE International nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that SAE International and its authors are supplying information, but are not attempting to render engineering or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

ISSN 2640-3536

e-ISSN 2640-3544

ISBN 978-1-4686-0127-5

To purchase bulk quantities, please contact: SAE Customer Service

E-mail: [CustomerService@sae.org](mailto:CustomerService@sae.org)

Phone: 877-606-7323 (inside USA and Canada)

724-776-4970 (outside USA)

Fax: 724-776-0790

Visit the SAE International Bookstore at [books.sae.org](http://books.sae.org)

## About the Editor



**Fabio Alonso da Silva** is currently the Head of Systems at ElletroCrafts Aerospace Ind., a mobility startup tasked with developing an urban air mobility vehicle or “flying car.” Additionally, da Silva is pursuing an MBA at the Warwick Business School/University of Warwick, UK.

With more than 20 years of experience in systems engineering, development, integration, and product sustainment, da Silva has worked at Embraer, Bombardier, Gulfstream, and recently Zoox, an automated driving system company. His professional journey has focused on development of fly-by-wire aircraft systems and autonomous systems for autonomous vehicles [1].

Da Silva is dedicated to the deployment of safe solutions for autonomous systems and made his mission to contribute to the discussion of the creation of a framework that would support obtaining safety clearance of such systems. He combines perspectives from technology, business, and vehicle certification.

# contents

**About the Editor**

**Unsettled Domains Concerning Autonomous System Validation and Verification Processes . . . . . 3**

- Introduction . . . . . 4**
- State of the Industry . . . . . 4*
  - Product Types . . . . . 4
  - Market Segments. . . . . 7
  - Generic Architecture. . . . . 7
  - Autonomous System. . . . . 8
  - Highly Integrated and Complex Systems Development Life Cycle. . . . . 9
    - Development Process Life Cycle . . . . . 9*
    - Requirement-Based Development . . . . . 9*
    - Functional Development . . . . . 11*
- Unsettled Domains Concerning Autonomous System Validation and Verification Processes. . . . . 11*

- Design Regulations . . . . . 11**
- Autonomous System Regulatory Requirements . . . 12*
  - Suggested Regulatory Text . . . . . 13
  - Means of Compliance . . . . . 14
  - Testing Strategy. . . . . 16
  - Scenarios. . . . . 16
- Recommendations. . . . . 16*

- Safety Assessment Process . . . . . 16**
- ARP4761 Approach . . . . . 17*
- ISO 26262 approach . . . . . 19*
- Comparison of Approaches and Adjustments. . . . . 19*
  - A Practical Case. . . . . 21

- How Scenarios Help Safety Analysis . . . . . 21*
- Assessing Different Products . . . . . 22*
- New Product Development. . . . . 22*
  - Integration of Autonomous System to Existing Platform. . . . . 22
- Validation and Verification Processes . . . . . 22*
  - Validation . . . . . 22
  - Verification. . . . . 23
- The Ethical Question and Moral Dilemmas . . . . . 23*
- Recommendations. . . . . 23*

- Control Architecture - Hardware. . . . . 23**
- Products and Businesses. . . . . 24*
- Verification of Control Architecture. . . . . 25*
- Recommendations. . . . . 25*

- Software V&V Challenges . . . . . 26**
- Nondeterministic Nature of AI Algorithms . . . . . 26*
- Cross-Domain Comparison of Software Development Assurance Standards . . . . . 26*
- Recommendations. . . . . 27*

- Conclusion . . . . . 27**
- SAE EDGE™ Research Reports . . . . . 27*
- Next Steps for Autonomous System V&V Processes . . 28*
- Recommendations. . . . . 28*
- Abbreviations/Definitions. . . . . 29*
- Acknowledgments . . . . . 29*
- References . . . . . 29*
- Contact Information . . . . . 30*

# Unsettled Domains Concerning Autonomous System Validation and Verification Processes

## Abstract

The Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) and the Department of Transportation's (DOT's) National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) face similar challenges regarding the regulation of autonomous systems powered by artificial intelligence (AI) algorithms that replace the human factor in the decision-making process. Validation and verification (V&V) processes contribute to implementation of correct system requirements and the development life cycle - starting with the definition of regulatory, marketing, operational, performance, and safety requirements. The V&V process is one of the steps of a development life cycle starting with the definition of regulatory, marketing, operational, performance, and safety requirements. They define what a product is, and they flow down into lower level requirements defining control architectures, hardware, and software. The industry is attempting to define regulatory requirements and a framework to gain safety clearance of such products. This report suggests a regulatory text and a safety and V&V approach from an aerospace engineering perspective assessing the replacement of the human driver from the decision-making role by a computational system. It also suggests an approach where aerospace guidelines can be used alongside the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) standard ISO 26262 in order to define a viable and valuable framework for autonomous systems safety clearance (or certification).

NOTE: SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are intended to identify and illuminate key issues in emerging, but still unsettled, technologies of interest to the mobility industry. The goal of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports is to stimulate discussion and work in the hope of promoting and speeding resolution of identified issues. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are not intended to resolve the issues they identify or close any topic to further scrutiny.

**FABIO ALONSO DA SILVA**  
*ElletroCrafts Aerospace Ind.*

**Edge Development Team**  
Alexandre Gesualdi, *ACG Consulting BR*  
Paulo Allemand Donato,  
*retired from Embraer*  
Robert Voros, *Textron Aviation*

ISSN 2640-3536